

Applied Mathematics & Information Sciences An International Journal

http://dx.doi.org/10.12785/amis/080506

Optimum Design of Parallelogram Five-bar Manipulator for Dexterous Workspace by using ELEMAEF in Differential Evolution

Miguel G. Villarreal-Cervantes*, Daniel De la Cruz-Muciño and Edgar A. Portilla-Flores

Postgraduate Department, Instituto Politécnico Nacional, Centro de Innovación y Desarrollo Tecnológico en Cómputo, 07700, Mexico

Received: 9 Aug. 2013, Revised: 6 Nov. 2013, Accepted: 7 Nov. 2013 Published online: 1 Sep. 2014

Abstract: The kinematic design of mechanism is an important stage in the design methodology. A dexterous workspace for a manipulator is an outstanding characteristic that must be considered in it. Hence, a mono-objective constraint optimization problem (MOCOP) for the kinematic design of a manipulator with three revolute joints (3R robot), that fulfils a defined dexterous workspace, is formulated. The MOCOP is solved by proposing a mechanism in the differential evolution (DE) algorithm called exhaustive local exploitation mechanism with adaptive scale factor (ELEMAEF). This mechanism exhaustively exploits a local region in the search space with the information of the base and the difference vectors of good trial vector, in an attempt to generate better individuals in the same direction. In addition, the ELEMAEF guides the evolution of the population toward a better zone without sacrificing the search capabilities of the DE algorithm. A comparison of the DE algorithm with and without the ELEMAEF for this particular design problem is presented. The use of the ELEMAEF gives a superior performance in the DE algorithm.

Keywords: Evolutionary algorithm, differential evolution, dexterous manipulator, kinematic design, parallelogram manipulator

1 Introduction

Analysis and synthesis of mechanisms [1] are the most important stages in the design methodology of parallel manipulators. The dimensional synthesis and workspace are two main characteristics which define a mechanism. They are the most studied issues in the field [2] [3]. The dimensional synthesis of a mechanism can be developed with graphical, analytical and numerical methods [4], [5]. On the other hand, the current methods for determining the manipulator's workspace and its boundary are classified as [6]: geometrical methods [7] [8], discretization methods [9] and numerical methods [10], [11]. Several robotic manipulators have a mechanism (closed kinematic chain) in their structure in order to improve the design performance. Those manipulators are called parallel one and present some advantages over serial manipulators, such as rigidity, dexterity, precision, velocity and acceleration [12]. One important characteristic that must be considered in the design of manipulators is the dexterous workspace. The dexterous workspace represents the region that can be reached by a

* Corresponding author e-mail: mvillarrealc@ipn.mx

point on the end-effector with any orientation, i.e., it is the volume or area which its end-effector can reach in the Cartesian space with different orientation [13], [14].

The design of a manipulator that meets one or several performance criteria such as trajectory accuracy, workspace, stiffness, singularity, dexterity, accuracy, etc., is a challenge because most of the performance criteria presents tradeoff among them and there is not just one solution that meets the aforementioned requirements. Hence, the manipulator design have been stated as an optimization problem where optimization techniques such as, heuristic algorithms [15], [16], [17], [18], [19], [20] and gradient based algorithms [21], have been used. Nevertheless, if the optimization problem is nonlinear or discontinuous one, gradient based algorithms are not suitable to solve the problem because they converge to local minima near the initial condition (sensitive to initial condition) [22], [23], then the design solution will perform poorly. So, it is important to have an algorithm that efficiently search in the design space to obtain a feasible solution, i.e., to obtain a set of parameters that describe the system and meet the design requirements.

Heuristic optimization techniques such as evolutionary algorithms (EAs), genetic algorithms (GAs) or particle swarm optimization (PSO) have been developed to solve complex engineering optimization problems. Some advantages of these approaches are: i) These are population-based methods, therefore they can produce several possible solutions. *ii*) They do not require additional information to start the search, i.e. the information of the gradient, the Hessian matrix, the initial search points, etc. iii) They do not require the objective functions and constraints to be continuous and/or differentiable. Finally, iv) They can be used and/or adapted to a large set of problems, because they do not need special mathematical formulation (problem transformation) in order to obtain a set of solutions.

Since Storn and Price proposed the algorithm of Differential Evolution (DE) in the middle of 90's [24], it has proven to be a powerful computational tool to solve optimization problems. The advantages of the DE is the easy computational implementation, the great adaptability to different kinds of optimization problems and the reasonable computing time, among others. However, this algorithm does not guarantee the convergence to the global optimum.

Studies [25], [26] have established that the mutation factor and the crossover probability influence in the DE performance. The mutation factor controls the rate at which the population evolves and the crossover probability controls the probability for a component to be selected from the mutant vector. Hence, several research works improve the mutation operator since it plays a key role in the DE performance. Efforts to improve the mutation operator were addressed considering the tradeoff between convergence speed and robustness [27]. Adaptive parameter control schemes [28] were introduced in the mutation strategy. Other researches combine different mutation strategies [22], [29]. Finally, some other researchers deals with the implementation of mechanisms and its effects to ensure better exploration and exploitation capabilities in the solution space such that the convergence to the global optimum may be found [30],[31], [32].

An efficient exploration mechanism in the search space and an effective exploitation mechanism in a region of the search space, would be desirable into the optimization algorithm. The exploration can widely search different regions in it, while the exploitation accelerates the convergence to the optimum solution in the region. Several researchers have explained the relationship between the exploration and exploitation [32], [33].

In this paper, an optimization problem for the kinematic design of a three revolute joint manipulator with a parallelogram five-bar mechanism that fulfils a defined dexterous workspace is stated. A mechanism to promote the local exploitation of the individuals that present an appropriate fitness is proposed and included in the DE/Rand/1/Bin algorithm. This mechanism uses the

vectors that form the mutant vector and an adaptive scale factor, in an attempt to guide the evolution of the DE algorithm to better zones. Hence, this mechanism is called Exhaustive Local Exploitation Mechanism with Adaptive Scale Factor (ELEMAEF). The DE algorithm with ELEMAEF is compared with the traditional DE/Rand/1/Bin algorithm (latter named it, DE algorithm without ELEMAEF) in order to show its performance in a particular optimization problem.

The main motivations of this work are: 1) the formal formulation, as an optimization problem, of the optimum design of the link lengths of a 3R manipulator which fulfills a defined dexterous workspace and 2) the proposal of the exhaustive local exploitation mechanism with adaptive scale factor in the DE/Rand/1/Bin which improves the DE performance for this particular problem.

The rest of the paper is organized as follows: The kinematic design of a 3R manipulator with a parallelogram five-bar mechanism is stated in section *II*. In section *III* the ELEMAEF in the differential evolution is explained. The experiments are detailed and discussed in section *IV*. Finally, the conclusions are commented in section *V*.

2 Design problem statement

The 3R manipulator with a parallelogram five-bar mechanism presents three degree of freedom in the joint space which provide the ability to move the tip of the end-effector (point $(\bar{x}_{i,j,k}, \bar{z}_{i,j,k})$ of the link 4 which is represented by an asterisk in Fig. 1) in the plane X - Zwith an orientation $\bar{\phi}_{i,j,k}$ with respect to the X axis of the inertial coordinate system X - Z. The parallelogram five-bar mechanism, included into the 3R robot, achieves a higher precision and a higher stiffness than a 3R robot without the parallelogram five-bar mechanism [12]. The 3*R* manipulator is shown in Fig. 1, where $l_i \forall i = 1, 2, ..., 4$ is the i - th link length, $(\bar{x}_{i,j,k}, \bar{z}_{i,j,k})$ and $\bar{\phi}_{i,j,k}$ are the Cartesian coordinate of the manipulator's end-effector and the angular position of the manipulator's end-effector, respectively. The desired dexterous workspace [13] is represented by an area with vertices $(\bar{x}_{d_{i,j,k}}, \bar{z}_{d_{i,j,k}})$ \forall i, j = 1, 2, where k = 1, 2, 3 is the k - th orientation that must fulfil the end-effector for each vertex. The k - thdesired orientation for each vertex is represented by the angle $\bar{\phi}_{d_{i,j,k}}$ as it is shown in Fig. 1.

The reachable workspace of a manipulator is the volume that its end-effector can reach in the Cartesian space. The dexterous workspace can be defined as the volume or area which its end-effector can reach in the Cartesian space with different orientation [13], [14]. Several robotic tasks require the manipulation of objects with different orientation (due to obstacles in the workspace or for positioning the end-effector tool). In this problem statement it is considered that the designer (user) requires a 3R robot with a parallelogram five-bar

2130





Fig. 1: Schematic diagram of the 3*R* manipulator with parallelogram five-bar mechanism.

mechanism to handle an object in a specific squared workspace (desired squared workspace) with different orientations, i.e. a robot with dexterous workspace is requested. The desired squared workspace is given by its vertexes. Then, the design problem is to find the link lengths of the 3R robot such that they fulfils the desired dexterous workspace subject to inherent design constraints.

In order to formulate the design problem, the following assumptions are considered:

- a)The desired workspace is squared shape with four vertices $(\bar{x}_{d_{i,j,k}}, \bar{z}_{d_{i,j,k}}) \forall i, j = 1, 2.$
- b)If the tip of the end-effector of the link 4 reaches the four vertices of the desired squared workspace with three different orientations (angle $\bar{\phi}_{i,j,k} \forall k = 1,2,3$ of the link 4), then the end-effector of the robot can reach any interior points in the desired squared workspace with at least the proposed three different orientations. Hence, a dexterous workspace is promoted.

In the next subsections, the design variables, objective function, constraints and the formal optimization problem statement for the design of the 3R robot with a desired dexterous workspace are detailed.

2.1 Design variables

In this paper the design variables of the 3*R* robot are the link lengths (l_1, l_2, l_3) and the angular position of the links $(q_{1_{i,j,k}}, q_{2_{i,j,k}}, q_{3_{i,j,k}})$ to reach the vertices of the desired workspace $((\bar{x}_{d_{i,j,k}}, \bar{z}_{d_{i,j,k}}))$ with *k* different orientations $\bar{\phi}_{d_{i,j,k}}$. Hence, the design variable vector is shown in (1) \forall *i*, *j* = 1, 2 and *k* = 1, 2, 3.

$$p = [l_1, l_3, l_4, q_{1_{i,j,k}}, q_{2_{i,j,k}}, q_{3_{i,j,k}}]^T \in \mathbb{R}^{39}$$
(1)

2.2 Objective function

The purpose for establishing an optimization problem in this paper is to design the robot with a desired dexterous workspace. It is clear that the objective function is established as the sum of the square of the Cartesian position error between the desired workspace vertex and the tip of the end-effector, plus the square of the angular position error between the desired orientation and the end-effector orientation. Hence, the objective function can be described in (2). The vertex positions of the desired dexterous chosen workspace are as (0.25m, 0.10m), $(\bar{x}_{d_{1,1,k}}, \bar{z}_{d_{1,1,k}})$ $(\bar{x}_{d_{1,2,k}}, \bar{z}_{d_{1,2,k}})$ (0.65m, 0.10m). $(\bar{x}_{d_{2,1,k}}, \bar{z}_{d_{2,1,k}})$ (0.25m, 0.40m)and $(\bar{x}_{d_{2,2,k}}, \bar{z}_{d_{2,2,k}}) = (0.65m, 0.40m)$. The subscript k indicate three different orientations in each vertex position. They are selected as $\bar{\phi}_{d_{i,j,1}} = -\frac{\pi}{2}rad$, $\bar{\phi}_{d_{i,j,2}} = 0rad$ and $\bar{\phi}_{d_{i,j,3}} = \frac{\pi}{2} rad \ \forall \ i, j = 1, 2.$

$$J = \int_{w} \left(\bar{x}_{d_{i,j,k}} - \bar{x}_{i,j,k} \right)^{2} dw + \int_{w} \left(\bar{z}_{d_{i,j,k}} - \bar{z}_{i,j,k} \right)^{2} dw + \frac{18}{\pi} \int_{w} \left(\bar{\phi}_{d_{i,j,k}} - \bar{\phi}_{i,j,k} \right)^{2} dw$$
(2)

In equation (2), the first two terms (Cartesian error) are equally weighted because they have the same units (meters). But, the last term a weight value of $\frac{18}{\pi}$ is selected by assuming that one degree is proporcional to one millimeter (0.001m). This weight value efficiently weights the last term with the other two in order to provide good solutions.

The direct kinematic (3)-(5) of the manipulator is used to define the Cartesian position of the end-effector in (2).

$$\bar{x}_{i,j,k} = l_1 \cos q_{1_{i,j,k}} - l_4 \cos \left(q_{2_{i,j,k}} \right) - l_5 \cos \left(q_{2_{i,j,k}} + q_{3_{i,j,k}} \right) \tag{3}$$

$$\bar{z}_{i,j,k} = l_1 \sin q_{1_{i,j,k}} - l_4 \sin \left(q_{2_{i,j,k}} \right) - l_5 \sin \left(q_{2_{i,j,k}} + q_{3_{i,j,k}} \right) \tag{4}$$

$$\bar{\phi}_{i,j,k} = q_{2_{i,j,k}} + q_{3_{i,j,k}} - \pi \tag{5}$$

2.3 Constraints

The parallel structure of the manipulator formed by the rectangle at links l_1 and l_2 , presents mobility constraints between them. Those constraints must be considered in the manipulator design and they are presented when the links 1 and 2 collide each other. The mobility constraints are stated in (6)-(7), which involves a total of 24 inequality constraints.

$$g_{1-12}: Tol_{Max2} - q_{2_{i,i,k}} + q_{1_{i,i,k}} \le 0 \tag{6}$$

$$g_{13-24}: q_{2_{i,i,k}} - q_{1_{i,i,k}} - \pi + Tol_{Max2} \le 0 \tag{7}$$

In addition, other 39 constraints must be included to bound the design variable vector p, i.e. limits in the link angle and in the link lengths. In (8)-(13), those constraints are shown, where $Tol_{Max1} = \frac{\pi}{36}rad$ and $Tol_{Max2} = \frac{5\pi}{36}rad$ are the minimum security angle that should have the links to prevent the impact.

$$g_{25-36}: 0 \le q_{1_{i,i,k}} \le \pi - Tol_{Max2} \tag{8}$$

$$g_{37-48}: Tol_{Max2} \le q_{2_{i,j,k}} \le \frac{3}{2}\pi - Tol_{Max2} \tag{9}$$

$$g_{49-60}: -\pi + Tol_{Max1} \le q_{3_{i,i,k}} \le \pi - Tol_{Max1}$$
(10)

$$g_{61}: l_{1_{Min}} \le l_1 \le l_{1_{Max}} \tag{11}$$

$$g_{62}: l_{3_{Min}} \le l_3 \le l_{3_{Max}} \tag{12}$$

$$g_{63}: l_{4_{Min}} \le l_4 \le l_{4_{Max}} \tag{13}$$

2.4 Optimization problem statement

The optimization problem for the 3*R* manipulator consists on finding the optimal design parameter vector $p * \in R^{39}$ (link lengths and angular positions) such that its end-effector (point (\bar{x}, \bar{y}) of the link 4) can reach a desired workspace with different orientations of the link 4 (dexterous workspace). Hence the optimization problem statement can be generally expressed as in (14)-(15), where $J \in R$ (2) is the objective function to be minimized and the equation $g \in R^{63}$ (15) is the inequality constraint vector (6)-(13).

$$\underset{p}{Min} J \tag{14}$$

Subject to:

2132

$$g(p) \le 0 \in \mathbb{R}^{63} \tag{15}$$

3 Optimization algorithms

The optimization problem (14)-(15) is solved by using eight variants of the differential evolution (DE) algorithm [34], [35] and by using the proposed exhaustive local exploitation mechanism in the eight variants of the differential evolution (DE) algorithm.

3.1 DE algorithm

The differential evolution (DE) algorithm consists of *NP* individuals $x_{i,G} = \begin{bmatrix} x_{1,i,G}, x_{2,i,G}, \dots, x_{j,i,G}, \dots, x_{D,i,G} \end{bmatrix}^T$ $\forall i = 1, 2, \dots, NP, G = 1, 2, \dots, GenMax$ called target population. Each individual $x_{i,G}$ contains D design variables which are limited by their bounds $[x_j^{\min}, x_j^{\max}] \forall j = 1, 2, ..., D$. The initial population $x_{j,i,G=0} \forall j = 1, ..., D$, i = 1, ..., NP is randomly selected considering their limits as follows: $x_{j,i,G=0} = x_j^{\min} + rand_j(0,1)(x_j^{\max} - x_j^{\min})$, where $rand_j$ is a uniformly distributed random number in the interval [0, 1].

3.1.1 Mutation and crossover

In each generation *G*, the mutation and crossover operator are used in the target population $x_{i,G}$ in order to generate other population called trial population with trial vectors $u_{i,G} = [u_{1,i,G}, u_{2,i,G}, ..., u_{j,i,G}, ..., u_{D,i,G},]^T \forall i = 1, 2, ..., NP$ as their individuals. There are several variants of the DE algorithm [34] which allow the exploration and exploitation of the search space for the DE algorithm. The main differences among them are in the mutation and crossover operator. The use of the DE variants depends on the problem at hand as it is stated in [36] and in [22]. In this paper the mutation and crossover operator of the DE/rand/1/bin, DE/rand/1/exp, Best/1/bin, Best/1/exp, Current to rand 1, Current to best 1, Current to rand 1 bin, Rand 2 Dir are used. The mutation and crossover variants are summarized in Fig. 2.

The scale factor $F \in (0,1]$ and $K \in (0,1)$ in the mutation process, are used to control the influence of the selected individuals in order to generate the mutant vector. The indexes r_1 , r_2 and r_3 are randomly chosen from the range [1,NP] and the index *best* represent the individual with the best objective function.

The uniform crossover generates trial vectors $u_{i,G}$ from the mutant vector $v_{i,G}$ or the target vector $x_{i,G}$ depending on the crossover probability *CR* (higher values mean less influence of the target vector, hence higher influence of the mutant vector). The crossover stage is not required in current-to-rand/1, current-to-best/1 and rand/2/dir, as it is observed in Fig. 2.

3.1.2 Constrained selection mechanism

Given that traditional DE [34] does not handle constrained optimization problem, the technique proposed in [37] is used to provide an elitism constrained selection mechanism (ECSM) in the DE algorithm ([38],[39],[40]). The ECSM determines between the trial vector $u_{i,G}$ and the target one $x_{i,G}$, which of them pass to the next generation $x_{i,G+1}$ and it depends on their fitness. This decision is based on the following statements:

- -Feasible solutions are preferred to any infeasible solution
- -Between two feasible solutions, the one having better objective function value is preferred.
- Between two infeasible solutions, the one having smaller constraint violation is preferred.



Nomenclature	Variant
rand/1/bin	$u_j^i = \begin{cases} v_j^i = x_j^{r_3} + F(x_j^{r_1} - x_j^{r_2}) & \text{if rand}_j(0, 1) < CR \text{ or } j = j_{rand} \\ x_j^i & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$
rand/1/exp	$u_j^i = \begin{cases} v_j^i = x_j^{r_3} + F(x_j^{r_1} - x_j^{r_2}) & \text{from } \operatorname{rand}_j(0, 1) < CR \text{ or } j = j_{rand} \\ x_j^i & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$
best/1/bin	$u_j^i = \begin{cases} v_j^i = x_j^{best} + F(x_j^{r_1} - x_j^{r_2}) & \text{if } \operatorname{rand}_j(0, 1) < CR \text{ or } j = j_{rand} \\ x_j^i & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$
best/1/exp	$u_j^i = \begin{cases} v_j^i = x_j^{best} + F(x_j^{r_1} - x_j^{r_2}) & \text{from } \operatorname{rand}_j(0, 1) < CR \text{ or } j = j_{rand} \\ x_j^i & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$
current-to-rand/1	$\mathbf{u}^i = v^i_j = \mathbf{x}^i + K(\mathbf{x}^{r_3} - \mathbf{x}^i) + F(\mathbf{x}^{r_1} - \mathbf{x}^{r_2})$
current-to-best/1	$\mathbf{u}^{i} = v_{j}^{i} = \mathbf{x}^{i} + K(\mathbf{x}^{best} - \mathbf{x}^{i}) + F(\mathbf{x}^{r_{1}} - \mathbf{x}^{r_{2}})$
current-to-rand/1/bin	$u_{j}^{i} = \begin{cases} v_{j}^{i} = x_{j}^{i} + K(x_{j}^{r_{3}} - x_{j}^{i}) + F(x_{j}^{r_{1}} - x_{j}^{r_{2}}) & \text{if } \operatorname{rand}_{j}(0, 1) < CR \text{ or } j = j_{rand} \\ x_{j}^{i} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$
rand/2/dir	$\mathbf{u}^i = v_j^i = \mathbf{w}^1 + \frac{F}{2}(\mathbf{w}^1 - \mathbf{w}^2 + \mathbf{w}^3 - \mathbf{w}^4)$ where $f(\mathbf{w}^1) < f(\mathbf{w}^2)$ and $f(\mathbf{w}^3) < f(\mathbf{w}^4)$

Fig. 2: DE variants.

3.1.3 Exhaustive local exploitation mechanism with adaptive scale factor

The exhaustive local exploitation mechanism with adaptive scale factor (ELEMAEF) consist on deeply searching on a previous direction if it presents better fitness. This mechanism favors the search in the neighborhood of the trial vector promoting efficient individual (local) exploitation. The exploration capabilities of the DE variants are not substantially diminishing because the ELEMAEF only enters when the trial vector presents better fitness (considering the constrained selection operation) than the target vector. When the ELEMAEF is activated, a new individual $\hat{\mathbf{u}}$ is generated by using the same mutation and crossover operation (the same base vector $x_{j,r_1,G}$ and the same difference vector $(x_{j,r_2,G} - x_{j,r_3,G})$ considering the adaptive scale factor F_2 proposed in [28]. If the new individual $\hat{\mathbf{u}}$ is better than $\mathbf{u}_{i,G+1}$, the new individual passes to the next generation. This is done repeatedly until the maximum number of searching N_w is fulfilled or when the new individual $\hat{\mathbf{u}}$ is worse than previous one $\mathbf{u}_{i,G+1}$. It is important to note that the proposed DE algorithm with the exhaustive local exploitation mechanism requires an additional parameter F_2 in the mutation process. The pseudocode of the exhaustive exploitation mechanism is observed in Fig. 3. In the next paragraph, the parameter adaptation of F_2 is introduced.

Parameter adaptation of F_2 : The mutation factor F_2 in the exhaustive local exploitation mechanism is self generated according to [28]. This factor uses a Cauchy distribution with a location parameter μ_{F_2} , specifying the location of the peak of the distribution and the scale parameter of 0.1 which specifies the half-width at half-maximum as it is observed in (16).

$$y = randc(\mu_{F_2}, 0.1) \tag{16}$$

$$F_{2} = \begin{vmatrix} 1, & if \ y \ge 1 \\ Recompute \ y, & if \ y \le 0 \\ y, & else \end{vmatrix}$$
(17)

The location parameter μ_{F_2} is initialized as 0.5 and then updated at the end of each generation according to (18), where the parameter S_{F_2} denote the set of all successful mutation factors in the ELEMAEF and c = 0.1is chosen. The *mean*_L(·) is the Lehmer mean stated in (19).

$$\mu_{F_2} = (1 - c) \cdot \mu_{F_2} + c \cdot mean_L(S_{F_2})$$
(18)

$$mean_L(S_{F_2}) = \frac{\sum S_{F_2}^2}{\sum S_{F_2}}$$
 (19)

The pseudocode of the DE algorithm with ELEMAEF is shown in Fig. 4.

4 Experiments and results

The proposed DE algorithm with ELEMAEF is programmed in Matlab Release 7.9 on a Windows platform. The experiments are performed on a PC with a 1.83 *GHz* Core 2 Duo with 2 *GB* of RAM. The population size *NP* consists on 36 individuals, the algorithm stops when the number of generations exceed $G_{Max} = 6500$ generations or when the mean of the objective function of the individuals in the current generation is smaller than 1e - 4. In order to analyze the results, the proposed DE algorithm with ELEMAEF is compared with the DE algorithm without ELEMAEF, by

using constant scaling factor F and constant crossover CR.

2134

Ten independent runs are carried out for each DE variants and for each of the following scale factor F = 0.3, 0.6, 0.9 and crossover parameters CR = 0.3, 0.6, 0.9. When the DE algorithm with ELEMAEF is used, the maximum number of local search $N_w = 10$ is chosen for each selected scale factor F and crossover parameter CR. Therefore, different "cases" are shown below in Table 1 and in Table 2 for each DE variants. Each case comprising ten independent runs.

In Table 1 and Table 2 the experimental results with different DE variants with and without ELEMAEF are shown, respectively. The meaning of the abbreviations in Tables is explained as follows: J_{mean} is the mean of the objective function values for the individuals in the last generation considering the ten runs. $\sigma(J)_{mean}$ is mean from the ten runs, of the standard deviation of the objective function values for the last generation. "Time" is the mean of the convergence time from the ten runs. MaxG_{mean} is the mean of the maximum number of generation for the ten runs. $#FunJ_{mean}$ is the mean of the times that the objective function is evaluated for the ten runs. $#ImpJ_{mean}$ is the mean of the sum of the times that the ELEMAEF improves the individual in each generation for the ten runs. J^* % is the percentage from the ten runs, which the optimum objective function value is reached in the population. It is considered that the optimum solution is reached when the objective function is less than 1e - 4 ($J^* < 1e - 4$).

DE variants without ELEMAEF

Based on the column $\sigma(J)_{mean}$ and the column J_{mean} in Table 1, it is observed that the low standard deviation

```
For w = 1 to N_w Do
 For j = 1 to D Do
   If u_{j,i,G+1} == x_{j,i,G} Then
    \hat{u}_j = x_{j,i,G+1}
   Else
     F_2 = randc_i(\mu_{F_2}, 0.1)
     \hat{u}_j = x_{j,r_1,G} + F_2(x_{j,r_2,G} - x_{j,r_3,G})
   End If
 End For
 If \hat{\mathbf{u}} is better than \mathbf{u}_{i,G+1} (Based on CSM) Then
  \mathbf{u}_{i,G+1} = \mathbf{\hat{u}}
  F_2 \rightarrow S_{F_2}
 Else
  \mathbf{u}_{i,G+1} = \mathbf{u}_{i,G+1}
  Break
 End If
End For
```

Fig. 3: Exhaustive exploitation mechanism added to the DE algorithm.

1	BEGIN
2	$G = 0; \mu_{F_2} = 0.5$
3	<i>Create a random population</i> $\mathbf{x}_{i,G} \forall i = 1,, NP$
4	Evaluate $J(\mathbf{x}_{i,G}), g(\mathbf{x}_{i,G}), \forall i = 1,, NP$
5	Do
6	$S_{F_2} = \emptyset$
7	For $i = 1$ to NP Do
8	Select randomly $\{r_1 \neq r_2 \neq r_3\} \in \mathbf{x}_G$.
9	$j_{rand} = randint(1, D)$
10	For $j = 1$ to D Do
11	Mutation and crossover
12	End For
13	Evaluate $J(\mathbf{u}_{i,G+1}), g(\mathbf{u}_{i,G+1})$
14	If $\mathbf{u}_{i,G+1}$ is better than $\mathbf{x}_{i,G}$ (Based on CSM) Then
15	Exhaustive local exploitation mechanism
16	$\mathbf{x}_{i,G+1} = \mathbf{u}_{i,G+1}$
17	Else
18	$\mathbf{x}_{i,G+1} = x_{i,G}$
19	End
20	$\mu_{F_2} = (1-c) \cdot \mu_{F_2} + c \cdot mean_L(S_{F_2})$
21	G = G + 1
22	While $(G \leq G_{Max})$
23	FND

Fig. 4: Pseudocode of the DE algorithm with the exhaustive local exploitation mechanism.

 $(\sigma(J)_{mean} \leq 0)$ indicates that most of the runs for each case converge to a solution (local solution whether J_{mean} is large and $\sigma(J)_{mean} \leq 0$ or global solution whether J_{mean} is small and $\sigma(J)_{mean} \leq 0$). The DE/Current to Rand/1, DE/Current to Best/1, DE/Current to Rand/1/Bin and DE/Rand/2/Dir converge in general to a local solution far away from the optimal one (see column J_{mean} and $\sigma(J)_{mean} \leq 0$). High standard deviation indicating that the individuals in the population are spread out over a large values. Then, DE/Rand/1/Exp range of and DE/Best/1/Exp diverge in most of the cases (see column $\sigma(J)_{mean} > 0$). In this particular design problem, the use of exponential crossover implies the large exploration of the search space, such that DE/Rand/1/Exp and DE/Best/1/Exp diverge in general.

The boldface rows in Table 1 indicate the best DE variants without ELEMAEF which solves the particular problem. Those are DE/Best/1/Bin, design DE/Rand/1/Bin and DE/Best/1/Exp because they find the optimum objective function at 44%, 22% and 11% of the cases (see column J^* %), respectively. This indicates that the use of binomial crossover with the use of random or best individual as the base vector, promotes the search of the optimum solution. As it is previously commented, the use of exponential crossover implies the large exploration of the search space but only for the case 8D when CR = 0.9 and F = 0.6, the DE/Best/1/Exp can find the optimum solution at 90% of the runs.



Table 1	: Experimental	results for	the DE	variants	without ELEMA	EF.
---------	----------------	-------------	--------	----------	---------------	-----

1401	UI. L/	sperim	Cintai	icsuits for		unts witho		ILI.	
Algorithm	Case	CR	F	J_{mean}	$\sigma(J)_{mean}$	Time	MaxGmean	#FunJ _{mean}	$J^{*}\%$
Rand 1 Bin	14	0.3	0.3	0.361753	8 8282e ⁻¹⁰	266.21	6500	234000	0%
Rand 1 Din	24	0.3	0.5	0.027252	0.02026	261.60	6500	224000	0%
Rand 1 Din	2A 2.4	0.5	0.0	5.007169	147.0004	201.00	6500	234000	0%
Rand I Bin	3A	0.3	0.9	5.00/168	147.8961	261.04	6500	234000	0%
Rand 1 Bin	4A	0.6	0.3	1.052967	$3.2852e^{-11}$	261.40	6500	234000	0%
Rand 1 Bin	5A	0.6	0.6	0.002540	5.8938e ⁻⁵	212.46	5794.5	208602	80%
Rand 1 Bin	6A	0.6	0.9	17.30592	251.8817	261.87	6500	234000	0%
Rand 1 Bin	74	0.9	0.3	21.85020	$1.8188e^{-5}$	262.06	6500	234000	0%
Dand 1 Bin	0 A	0.9	0.5	0 100544	5 6925 -4	162.00	4710	160894	50%
Kand I Bin	ðA	0.9	0.0	0.109544	5.08556	162.09	4/19	109884	50%
Rand 1 Bin	9A	0.9	0.9	0.159810	0.062602	262.62	6500	234000	0%
Rand 1 Exp	1B	0.3	0.3	472.0137	283.3315	186.91	6500	234034	0%
Rand 1 Exp	2B	0.3	0.6	538.1129	303.1237	186.95	6500	234034	0%
Rand 1 Exp	3B	0.3	0.9	541.7425	267.4548	187.01	6500	234035	0%
Rand 1 Exp	AR	0.6	0.3	438 5806	294 4790	188 21	6500	234035	0%
Rand 1 Exp	5 D	0.0	0.5	527 2427	275 9299	100.21	6500	224026	0%
Raid I Exp	5D CD	0.0	0.0	527.3437	273.8388	100.20	6500	234030	0%
Rand I Exp	6B	0.6	0.9	569.5916	268.5908	188.25	6500	234035	0%
Rand 1 Exp	7B	0.9	0.3	54.90616	0	196.60	6500	234017	0%
Rand 1 Exp	8B	0.9	0.6	0.700875	0.137024	196.07	6500	234035	0%
Rand 1 Exp	9B	0.9	0.9	544.2769	221,4091	196.28	6500	234036	0%
Best 1 Bin	10	0.3	0.3	689 6785	0	157.96	6500	62222	0%
Post 1 Din	20	0.3	0.5	15 65022	6 805560	152 50	6042	217520	2004
Dest 1 Dir	20	0.3	0.0	0.00/024	7 421126	164 17	6500	21/330	20070 00/
Best I Bin	50	0.5	0.9	9.096234	1.451120	104.1/	0500	254056	0%
Best 1 Bin	4C	0.6	0.3	2563.211	0	155.92	6500	23386	0%
Best 1 Bin	5C	0.6	0.6	1.111960	0.000127	117.95	4678	168440	50%
Best 1 Bin	6C	0.6	0.9	6.671277	0.158473	158.03	6284	226274	30%
Best 1 Bin	7C	0.9	0.3	6595.621	0	154.20	6500	3211	0%
Best 1 Bin	80	0.9	0.6	929 9061	Õ	163 17	6500	234036	0%
Bost 1 Din	00	0.9	0.0	53 79760	0.001746	156.90	6270	23-1050	1004
Best I Bill	90	0.9	0.9	33.78700	0.001740	130.89	6270	223739	10%
Best I Exp	1D	0.3	0.3	627.9030	456.1873	188.01	6500	234012	0%
Best 1 Exp	2D	0.3	0.6	535.1099	318.0737	188.06	6500	234010	0%
Best 1 Exp	3D	0.3	0.9	546.6142	275.7620	188.06	6500	234011	0%
Best 1 Exp	4D	0.6	0.3	575.4174	386.8449	189.37	6500	234025	0%
Best 1 Exp	5D	0.6	0.6	451 7013	331 9883	189 36	6500	234019	0%
Best 1 Exp	6D	0.6	0.0	563 4715	304 5132	180.34	6500	234021	0%
Best 1 Exp	70	0.0	0.9	007.5407	504.5152	101.57	6500	234021	0%
Best I Exp		0.9	0.5	987.5407	0	191.57	6500	64915	0%
Best 1 Exp	8D	0.9	0.6	2.474110	0.004745	107.96	3548	127768	90%
Best 1 Exp	9D	0.9	0.9	6.560564	0.157588	197.53	6500	234025	0%
Current to Rand 1	1E	0.3	0.3	6686.528	0	137.39	6500	84511	0%
Current to Rand 1	2E	0.3	0.6	3414.828	0	142.92	6500	234036	0%
Current to Rand 1	35	0.3	0.9	1288 256	0.000285	142.65	6500	234036	0%
Current to Rand 1		0.5	0.9	7016.050	12 40574	125 70	6500	42207	0%
	4 <i>L</i>	0.0	0.5	/910.030	15.40574	155.70	0300	42207	0%
Current to Rand 1	5E	0.6	0.6	2944.626	0	142.90	6500	234036	0%
Current to Rand 1	6E	0.6	0.9	1298.420	0.005519	142.60	6500	234036	0%
Current to Rand 1	7E	0.9	0.3	7355.543	0	137.20	6500	82625	0%
Current to Rand 1	8E	0.9	0.6	3093.975	8.023190	142.87	6500	234036	0%
Current to Rand 1	9F	0.9	0.9	1124 290	0	142 67	6500	234036	0%
Current to heat 1	1E	0.2	0.2	6504.952	0	120.04	6500	109142	00/
Current to best 1	25	0.5	0.5	0394.033	0	129.94	6500	224026	0%
Current to best 1	2F	0.3	0.6	3764.453	0	134.97	6500	234036	0%
Current to best 1	3F	0.3	0.9	2573.786	0	134.70	6500	234036	0%
Current to best 1	4F	0.6	0.3	6701.564	0	127.97	6500	49401	0%
Current to best 1	5F	0.6	0.6	3644.155	40.42009	135.23	6500	234036	0%
Current to best 1	6F	0.6	0.9	3359.008	0.000003	134.86	6500	234036	0%
Current to best 1	7F	0.9	03	6670 760	0	128 69	6500	71767	0%
Current to best 1	8F	0.9	0.5	3065 115	0	135 21	6500	23/036	0%
Current to best 1	01	0.9	0.0	2101 107	0.001595	124.01	6500	234030	0 /0
Current to best 1	91	0.9	0.9	5191.107	0.001585	154.91	0500	254030	0%
Current to rand 1 Bin	1G	0.3	0.3	1242.558	11.53473	163.10	6500	97103	0%
Current to rand 1 Bin	2G	0.3	0.6	0.154404	0.079587	167.97	6500	234036	0%
Current to rand 1 Bin	3G	0.3	0.9	467.4536	97.92991	168.02	6500	234036	0%
Current to rand 1 Bin	4G	0.6	0.3	3166.224	0	164.09	6500	51426	0%
Current to rand 1 Bin	56	0.6	0.6	0 157648	0.000035	170 71	6500	234036	0%
Current to rand 1 Din	60	0.0	0.0	1202 751	177 2152	170.07	6500	234026	0%
Current to rand 1 Bin	00	0.0	0.9	1205.751	177.3152	1/0.9/	6500	254030	0%
Current to rand 1 Bin	/G	0.9	0.3	6110.778	0	167.23	6500	/2893	0%
Current to rand 1 Bin	8G	0.9	0.6	20.48629	0.014726	173.40	6500	234036	0%
Current to rand 1 Bin	9G	0.9	0.9	0.627232	0.019767	173.17	6500	234036	0%
Rand 2 Dir	1H	0.3	0.3	6060.665	0	137.87	6500	183369	0%
Rand 2 Dir	2H	03	0.6	3987 782	Õ	139.84	6500	234036	0%
Rand 2 Dir	211	0.2	0.0	2086 551	0	130 51	6500	234025	0%
Dand 2 Di	511 411	0.5	0.2	2000.331	0	120.94	6500	224033	0.00
Rand 2 Dir	4H	0.6	0.3	6/18.683	0	139.86	6500	252804	0%
Rand 2 Dir	5H	0.6	0.6	4508.276	0	139.88	6500	234036	0%
Rand 2 Dir	6H	0.6	0.9	2201.797	0	139.70	6500	234036	0%
Rand 2 Dir	7H	0.9	0.3	7158.456	0	138.57	6500	195107	0%
Rand 2 Dir	8H	0.9	0.6	3920 266	0	139.98	6500	234036	0%
Rand 2 Dir	0 <i>H</i>	0.9	0.0	2100 025	0	139.73	6500	23/036	0%
Kanu 2 Dii	211	0.7	0.7	2100.023	0	137.13	0500	20+000	U /0



DE algorithm with ELEMAEF

Based on the column $\sigma(J)_{mean}$ and the column J_{mean} in Table 2, it is observed that the worst DE variants are: DE/Current to Rand/1, DE/Current to Best/1 and DE/Rand/2/Dir because they converge to a local solution at 44%, 55% and 100% of the cases, respectively and the rest of the cases diverge (see column $\sigma(J)_{mean} > 0$).

In Table 2 the best DE variants are marked in boldface. Those are: DE/Rand/1/Bin, DE/Best/1/Bin, DE/Current to Rand/1/Bin, DE/Rand/1/Exp, DE/Best/1/Exp. They find the optimum solution at 88%, 77%, 33%, 22%, 22% of the cases, respectively. In addition, in column $\#ImpJ_{mean}$, it is observed that larger improvement of the individual by using the ELEMAEF, results the convergence to local solutions far away from the optimum one.

The number of times that the individuals are improved by the ELEMAEF for one run with different DE variants is shown in Fig. 5. The results in Fig. 5 find the global optimum in the last generation. The horizontal line in the figures represent the mean of the times that the ELEMAEF improves the individual in the generation. It is observed in the first generations, the algorithm explores the solution space such that the ELEMAEF generates few improved solutions. Then, after the first generations, the ELEMAEF exhaustively search in the vicinity of the individuals with better fitness such that more improved individuals are found. It is important to note, that the ELEMAEF and the selection of the parameter adaptation of F_2 do not guide the exhaustive search towards local regions.

Comparative results

In Table 3, comparative results between the DE variants with the use of ELEMAEF and without it are shown. The results are marked in **boldface** to indicate the **DE** variant with the use of ELEMAEF and in italic to indicate DE variant without the use of ELEMAEF. The column "% Optimum solution" indicates the percentage of the cases for each DE variant where the algorithm converge to the optimum solution. It is observed that the use of ELEMAEF increases the times that the DE variant converge to the optimum solution. This fact indicates that the ELEMAEF promotes the exploitation of the individuals in the population such that better individuals are found. On the other hand, the column "Best C. Time" represents the DE variant that provide less convergence time. It is clear that the incorporation of the ELEMAEF in the DE variants requires more computing time due to more objective function evaluation is required.

It is important to point out that the use of ELEMAEF occasionally improves the individual in each generation (see $\#ImpJ_{mean}$ in Table 2), but this is sufficient to improve the DE variant behavior with respect to the DE variant without ELEMAEF. This indicates that a trade off





Fig. 5: Number of times that the individuals are improved by the Exhaustive Local Mechanism.



Algorithm	Case	CR	F	J_{mean}	$\sigma(J)_{mean}$	Time	$MaxG_{mean}$	$#FunJ_{mean}$	$J^*\%$	#ImpJ _{mean}
Rand 1 Bin	1Ā	0.3	0.3	0.071963	0.000080	161.87	4532	297048	60%	16 13
Dond 1 Din	21	0.2	0.0	0.012780	0.000000	127.01	40.02	224572	700/	15 14
Kanu I Din	2/1	0.5	0.0	0.012789	0.000049	137.01	4047	234373	7070	13.14
Rand 1 Bin	3A	0.3	0.9	7.674573	1.876054	191.05	6500	253746	10%	2.55
Rand 1 Bin	$4\overline{A}$	0.6	0.3	0.033166	0.000149	243.76	6143	388596	40 %	13.41
Rand 1 Bin	5Ā	0.6	0.6	0 021057	0 000047	75 79	2030	116272	90%	15 40
Dond 1 Din	61	0.6	0.0	0.086668	0.002166	152 12	4718	212452	7004	Q 12
Kanu I Din	0/4	0.0	0.9	0.000000	0.003100	133.12	4/10	212433	7070	0.13
Rand 1 Bin	7A	0.9	0.3	51.95243	0.006939	308.83	6500	449920	0%	19.13
Rand 1 Bin	8Ā	0.9	0.6	0.471681	0.000510	230.4 8	4809	337603	50%	25.78
Rand 1 Bin	9Ā	0.9	0.9	0.006594	0.000026	165.76	4174	230469	60%	16.90
Pond 1 Evn	1 0	0.2	0.2	529 7221	202 1712	215.95	6500	250022	004	1.20
Rand I Exp	10	0.5	0.5	536.7221	292.1/12	215.65	6500	230933	070	1.29
Rand I Exp	2B	0.3	0.6	549.9120	282.5619	215.63	6500	249592	0%	1.15
Rand 1 Exp	3B	0.3	0.9	561.9273	259.6416	215.74	6500	249834	0%	1.28
Rand 1 Exp	$4\overline{B}$	0.6	0.3	535.3635	343.9401	216.79	6500	249037	0%	1.18
Rand 1 Exp	$5\overline{B}$	0.6	0.6	544.3737	287.7287	216.85	6500	247690	0%	1.08
Rand 1 Exp	$6\overline{R}$	0.6	0.9	590 3187	255 9502	216.82	6500	247460	0%	1.15
Dond 1 Exp	70	0.0	0.2	0.019500	0.000034	199 70	4651	242525	700/	26.02
Kanu I Exp	/D	0.9	0.5	0.018500	0.000034	100.79	4051	343525	70%	20.03
Rand 1 Exp	8B	0.9	0.6	0.015631	0.000023	213.38	5758	304331	50%	10.92
Rand 1 Exp	$9\bar{B}$	0.9	0.9	242.0042	87.92096	224.36	6500	247735	0%	1.45
Best 1 Bin	1Ē	0.3	0.3	42 94217	0.009001	253 15	6085	569326	20%	41 79
Post 1 Pin	20	0.2	0.6	0 122720	0 202462	200.66	4000	476508	2004	12.16
Dest I Dill	2C	0.5	0.0	0.132729	0.203403	209.00	4777	4/0390	3070	45.10
Best 1 Bin	3C	0.3	0.9	0.622174	1.413398	179.06	5438	307992	50%	18.21
Best 1 Bin	4C	0.6	0.3	107.5080	0.013497	409.51	6500	816277	0%	71.20
Best 1 Bin	5Ē	0.6	0.6	4.175193	0.001241	333.49	6204	642686	10%	42.45
Best 1 Bin	6Ē	0.6	0.0	0.018021	0.007005	178.08	1388	302203	40%	10
Dest I Dill	70	0.0	0.9	1520.057	0.097003	170.00	4500	1020.000	40 /0	140.00
Best I Bin	10	0.9	0.3	1538.257	0.38/008	/30.11	6500	1230698	0%	140.66
Best 1 Bin	8C	0.9	0.6	84.81393	0.003082	407.47	6435	655529	10%	39.66
Best 1 Bin	9Ē	0.9	0.9	75.57373	0.000008	467.14	6434	777978	10%	72.60
Best 1 Exp	1D	0.3	0.3	744 2973	1184 047	219.45	6500	234202	0%	15.43
Bost 1 Exp	25	0.3	0.5	597 5616	248 0202	219.45	6500	224527	0%	12.65
Best I Exp	20	0.5	0.0	502.1025	346.9203	210.44	6500	234337	070	12.03
Best I Exp	3D	0.3	0.9	583.1925	285.3257	218.00	6500	235038	0%	11.06
Best 1 Exp	4D	0.6	0.3	547.9760	584.6983	221.10	6500	234236	0%	15.72
Best 1 Exp	$5\overline{D}$	0.6	0.6	549.1788	368.3518	219.27	6500	234587	0%	10.65
Best 1 Exp	$6\overline{D}$	0.6	0.9	635.6344	302.6703	218.61	6500	235061	0%	8.74
Best 1 Exp	$7\bar{D}$	0.9	0.3	865 6287	0.000000	556 31	6500	73758	0%	318.07
Dest 1 Exp	0D	0.9	0.5	0.002255	0.000000	142 79	2076	107594	0.00	04 72
Best I Exp	a D	0.9	0.0	0.002355	0.000049	142.70	2970	10/204	90%	94.75
Best 1 Exp	9Đ	0.9	0.9	1.774057	0.284646	232.16	6475	233948	10%	16.75
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1	9 D 1 <i>Ē</i>	0.9	0.9	1.774057 6613.680	0.284646 2018.004	232.16 504.97	6475 6500	233948 808565	10% 0%	16.75 78.45
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	9 D 1 <i>Ē</i> 2 <i>Ē</i>	0.9 0.3 0.3	0.9 0.3 0.6	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736	0.284646 2018.004 0	232.16 504.97 332.63	6475 6500 6500	233948 808565 524796	10% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	9D 1Ē 2Ē 3Ē	0.9 0.3 0.3	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037	0.284646 2018.004 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53	6475 6500 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674	10% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	9 <u>1</u> 2 \bar{E} 3 \bar{E} 4 \bar{E}	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5007.270	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61	6475 6500 6500 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808426	10% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.24
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	9 D 1 <i>Ē</i> 2 <i>Ē</i> 3 <i>Ē</i> 4 <i>Ē</i> 5 <i>Ē</i>	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61	6475 6500 6500 6500 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436	10% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	9 D 1 <i>Ē</i> 2 <i>Ē</i> 3 <i>Ē</i> 4 <i>Ē</i> 5 <i>Ē</i>	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83	6475 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579	10% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59	6475 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	9 D 1 <i>Ē</i> 2 <i>Ē</i> 3 <i>Ē</i> 4 <i>Ē</i> 5 <i>Ē</i> 6 <i>Ē</i> 7 <i>Ē</i>	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49	6475 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	9 D 1 <i>Ē</i> 2 <i>Ē</i> 3 <i>Ē</i> 4 <i>Ē</i> 5 <i>Ē</i> 6 <i>Ē</i> 7 <i>Ē</i> 8 <i>Ē</i>	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42	6475 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	9D 1Ē 2Ē 3Ē 4Ē 5Ē 6Ē 7Ē 8Ē 9Ē	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666 130	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58	6475 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 65	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	9D 1Ē 2Ē 3Ē 4Ē 5Ē 6Ē 7Ē 8Ē 9Ē	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4070.254	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58	6475 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 65	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Rand 1	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{F} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14	6475 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to best 1 Current to best 1	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94	6475 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 35
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Band 1 Current to best 1 Current to best 1 Current to best 1	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 24.35 20.89
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to best 1 Current to best 1 Current to best 1 Current to best 1	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 0 2552.972	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1	$9\bar{D}$ $1\bar{E}$ $2\bar{E}$ $3\bar{E}$ $4\bar{E}$ $5\bar{E}$ $6\bar{E}$ $7\bar{E}$ $8\bar{E}$ $9\bar{E}$ $1\bar{F}$ $3\bar{F}$ $4\bar{F}$ $5\bar{F}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 0 2552.972 3.508465	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to best 1 C	$9\bar{D}$ $1\bar{E}$ $2\bar{E}$ $3\bar{E}$ $4\bar{E}$ $5\bar{E}$ $6\bar{E}$ $7\bar{E}$ $8\bar{E}$ $9\bar{E}$ $1\bar{F}$ $2\bar{F}$ $3\bar{F}$ $4\bar{F}$ $5\bar{F}$ $6\bar{F}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481553	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 0 2552.972 3.508465 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0%	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 20.86
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 C	$9\bar{D}$ $1\bar{E}$ $2\bar{E}$ $3\bar{E}$ $4\bar{E}$ $5\bar{E}$ $6\bar{E}$ $7\bar{E}$ $8\bar{E}$ $2\bar{F}$ $3\bar{F}$ $4\bar{F}$ $5\bar{F}$ $7\bar{E}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2552.340	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 435845	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.62
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to best 1 C	$9\bar{D}$ $1\bar{E}$ $2\bar{E}$ $3\bar{E}$ $4\bar{E}$ $5\bar{E}$ $6\bar{E}$ $7\bar{E}$ $3\bar{F}$ $4\bar{F}$ $5\bar{F}$ $6\bar{F}$ $7\bar{F}$ 7	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 325.63 62.60
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 C	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0	$\begin{array}{r} \textbf{232.16} \\ \hline \textbf{504.97} \\ \textbf{322.63} \\ \textbf{301.53} \\ \textbf{504.61} \\ \textbf{327.83} \\ \textbf{301.59} \\ \textbf{512.49} \\ \textbf{328.42} \\ \textbf{301.58} \\ \textbf{1261.14} \\ \textbf{1007.94} \\ \textbf{278.74} \\ \textbf{1286.55} \\ \textbf{1011.69} \\ \textbf{278.36} \\ \textbf{1295.63} \\ \textbf{1015.62} \end{array}$	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	$\begin{array}{r} \textbf{16.75} \\ \hline 78.45 \\ 30.90 \\ 29.52 \\ 78.34 \\ 30.02 \\ 29 \\ 80.31 \\ 30.16 \\ 29.54 \\ \hline 316.64 \\ 24.35 \\ 20.89 \\ 324.01 \\ 225.39 \\ 20.86 \\ 325.63 \\ 226.08 \\ \end{array}$
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 C	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1E \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	$\begin{array}{r} \textbf{16.75} \\ \hline 78.45 \\ 30.90 \\ 29.52 \\ 78.34 \\ 30.02 \\ 29 \\ 80.31 \\ 30.16 \\ 29.54 \\ \hline 316.64 \\ 224.35 \\ 20.89 \\ 324.01 \\ 225.39 \\ 20.86 \\ 325.63 \\ 226.08 \\ 20.96 \\ \hline \end{array}$
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin	9 D 1 <i>E</i> 2 <i>Ē</i> 3 <i>Ē</i> 5 <i>Ē</i> 6 <i>Ē</i> 7 <i>Ē</i> 8 <i>Ē</i> 9 <i>Ē</i> 1 <i>F</i> 2 <i>F</i> 3 <i>F</i> 4 <i>F</i> 5 <i>F</i> 6 <i>F</i> 7 <i>F</i> 8 <i>F</i> 9 <i>F</i> 1 <i>G</i>	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.63 226.08 325.63 20.86 325.63 20.96 196.04
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to to Best 1 Current to Tand 1 Bin Current to Rand 1 Bin	9 Ď 1 <i>E</i> 2 <i>Ē</i> 3 <i>Ē</i> 4 <i>Ē</i> 5 <i>Ē</i> 6 <i>Ē</i> 7 <i>Ē</i> 8 <i>Ē</i> 9 <i>Ē</i> 1 <i>F</i> 2 <i>F</i> 3 <i>F</i> 4 <i>F</i> 5 <i>F</i> 6 <i>F</i> 7 <i>F</i> 8 <i>F</i> 9 <i>F</i> 1 <i>G</i> 2 <i>Č</i>	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0,792429	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0 0 2732722	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 186.74	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 313
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{C} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2555.349 0 0 7321.067 0.222792 161 2644	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 186.74	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236571	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{\mathbf{G}} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0.222792 161.8644 4079.354	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 189.46 199.55	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 236271 236271	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.7 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634	0.284646 2018.004 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0.222792 161.8644 6087.996	$\begin{array}{r} \textbf{232.16} \\ \hline \textbf{504.97} \\ \textbf{322.63} \\ \textbf{301.53} \\ \textbf{504.61} \\ \textbf{327.83} \\ \textbf{301.59} \\ \textbf{512.49} \\ \textbf{328.42} \\ \textbf{301.58} \\ \textbf{1261.14} \\ \textbf{1007.94} \\ \textbf{278.74} \\ \textbf{1286.55} \\ \textbf{1011.69} \\ \textbf{278.74} \\ \textbf{1286.55} \\ \textbf{1011.69} \\ \textbf{278.74} \\ \textbf{1286.55} \\ \textbf{1015.62} \\ \textbf{278.51} \\ \textbf{473.64} \\ \textbf{186.74} \\ \textbf{189.46} \\ \textbf{805.56} \end{array}$	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{G} \\ \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.6 0.6 0.7 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.0 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2555.349 0 0 7321.067 0.22792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 186.74 189.46 805.56 163.34	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{\mathbf{G}} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{\mathbf{G}} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.7 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.7 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.4 0.5	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0.222792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 147.77 0.03
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{G} \\ 7\bar{G} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.0 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435 739	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0.22792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283 3455 679	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 291 07
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current Bin Current to rand 1 Bin C	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{G} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ 7\bar{G} \\ 8\bar{C} \\ 8C$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.7 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.4	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.0	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2555.349 0 0 7321.067 0.222792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283 3452.629 0.01469	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 186.74 186.74 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 530977	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 29.107 24.11
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to ran	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{\mathbf{G}} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{\mathbf{G}} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ 7\bar{G} \\ 8\bar{\mathbf{G}} \\ 8\bar{\mathbf{G}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0.222792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0.0001469 0.001469 0.001469 0.001469 0.00001469 0.00001469 0.00000000000000000000000000000000000	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 291.07 34.11
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{G} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ 7\bar{G} \\ 8\bar{G} \\ 9\bar{G} \\ 9\bar{G} \\ \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.0	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221 0.029537	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0.222792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0.000654	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52 193.79	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077 236592	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 291.07 34.11 .037
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current bin Current to rand 1 Bin	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{G} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ 7\bar{G} \\ 8\bar{G} \\ 9\bar{G} \\ 1\bar{H} \\ \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.5 0.9 0.3 0.5 0.5 0.9 0.3 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221 0.029537 12243.65	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2555.349 0 0 7321.067 0.222792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000666 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0.001654 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 186.74 186.74 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52 193.79 1402.93	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077 236592 196155	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 291.07 34.11 .037 338.31
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Bin Cu	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{\mathbf{G}} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{\mathbf{G}} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ 7\bar{G} \\ 8\bar{\mathbf{G}} \\ 9\bar{\mathbf{G}} \\ 1\bar{H} \\ 2\bar{H} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221 0.029537 12243.65 5569.629	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0.222792 161.8644 6087.996 0.0000666 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0.000654 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 186.74 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52 193.79 1402.93 1071.48	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077 236592 196155 234550	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 291.07 34.11 .037 338.31 248.05
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to Rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Din Current to rand 1	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{G} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ 7\bar{G} \\ 8\bar{G} \\ 9\bar{G} \\ 1\bar{H} \\ 2\bar{H} \\ 3\bar{H} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.0	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221 0.029537 12243.65 556.629 3138.329	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0.22792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0.000654 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52 193.79 1402.93 1071.48 653.92	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077 236592 196155 234550 234699	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 29.107 338.31 248.05 134.86
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{G} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ 7\bar{G} \\ 8\bar{G} \\ 9\bar{G} \\ 1\bar{H} \\ 2\bar{H} \\ 4\bar{\mu} \\ 3\bar{H} \\ 4\bar{\mu} \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.7 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.7 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.5 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.5 0.6 0.5 0.6 0.5 0.5 0.6 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0.5 0	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.7	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 663.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 44851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221 0.029537 12243.65 5569.629 3138.329 12132.54	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2555.349 0 0 7321.067 0.22792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0.000054 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 186.74 186.74 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52 193.79 1402.93 1071.48 653.92 1357.92	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077 236592 196155 234590 216758	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.86 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 291.07 338.31 248.05 134.86 325.91
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 2 Dir Rand 2 Dir Rand 2 Dir	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 2\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{G} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ 7\bar{G} \\ 8\bar{G} \\ 9\bar{G} \\ 1\bar{H} \\ 2\bar{H} \\ 3\bar{H} \\ 4\bar{H} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 7F$	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221 0.029537 12243.65 5569.629 3138.329 12132.54	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2555.349 0 0 7321.067 0.222792 161.8644 6087.996 0.0000666 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0.0000654 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 186.74 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52 193.79 1402.93 1071.48 653.92 1357.02 1072.02	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077 236592 196155 234550 234699 216758 224699	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 291.07 34.11 .037 338.31 248.05 134.86 325.81 24.60
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{G} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ \bar{G} \\ G$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.0	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221 0.029537 12243.65 556.629 3138.329 3123.524 6260.418 2020.525	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0.22792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0.0000654 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52 193.79 1402.93 1071.48 653.92 1357.02 1073.60	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077 236592 196155 234699 216758 234488	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29,52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 291.07 338.31 248.05 134.86 325.81 248.69
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 2 Dir Rand	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 7E$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.7 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221 0.029537 12243.65 5569.629 3138.329 12132.54 6260.418 3300.208	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 0 7321.067 0.22722 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0.0000554 0 0 0.000006	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 186.74 186.74 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52 193.79 1402.93 1071.48 653.92 1357.02 1073.60 657.54	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077 236592 196155 234590 234699 216758 234488 234734	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 291.07 338.31 248.05 134.86 325.81 248.69 135.83
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 2 Dir Rand	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ \mathbf{G} \\$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.0 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 556.7300 2755.634 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221 0.029537 12243.65 5569.629 3138.329 12132.54 6260.418 3300.208 10512.23	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 0 2555.349 0 0 7321.067 0.22792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0 0 0 0 0 0 0.0000054 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 186.74 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52 193.79 1402.93 1071.48 653.92 1357.02 1073.60 657.54 1370.32	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077 236592 196155 234550 234699 216758 234488 234734 210425	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29.52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29.54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 291.07 34.11 .037 338.31 248.05 134.86 325.81 248.69 135.83 329.57
Best 1 Exp Current to Rand 1 Current to Best 1 Current to rand 1 Bin Current to rand 1 Current to	$\begin{array}{c} 9\bar{\mathbf{D}} \\ 1\bar{E} \\ 2\bar{E} \\ 3\bar{E} \\ 4\bar{E} \\ 5\bar{E} \\ 6\bar{E} \\ 7\bar{E} \\ 8\bar{E} \\ 9\bar{E} \\ 1\bar{F} \\ 2\bar{F} \\ 3\bar{F} \\ 4\bar{F} \\ 5\bar{F} \\ 7\bar{F} \\ 8\bar{F} \\ 9\bar{F} \\ 1\bar{G} \\ 3\bar{G} \\ 4\bar{G} \\ 5\bar{G} \\ 6\bar{G} \\ 7\bar{G} \\ 8\bar{G} \\ 9\bar{G} \\ 1\bar{H} \\ 2\bar{H} \\ 3\bar{H} \\ 5\bar{H} \\ 8\bar{H} \\ \end{array}$	0.9 0.3 0.3 0.6 0.6 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.9	0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.3 0.6 0.9 0.9 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.9 0.0 0.0	1.774057 6613.680 4719.736 2648.037 5907.370 4336.297 2842.934 7404.721 5123.504 2666.130 9518.423 5315.249 4772.813 9741.819 5787.309 4481.553 9941.413 4851.411 4965.898 2137.612 0.792429 0.792429 0.792429 0.792429 0.792429 0.792429 1.223.564 0.069026 1101.626 5435.739 4.293221 0.029537 12243.65 5569.629 3138.329 12132.54 6260.418 3300.208 10512.23 5508.342	0.284646 2018.004 0 0 1781.042 3.845465 0 998.5876 6.872291 0 4079.354 0 2552.972 3.508465 0 2505.349 0 0 7321.067 0.22792 161.8644 6087.996 0.000066 164.5283 3452.629 0.001469 0.0000654 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	232.16 504.97 332.63 301.53 504.61 327.83 301.59 512.49 328.42 301.58 1261.14 1007.94 278.74 1286.55 1011.69 278.36 1295.63 1015.62 278.51 473.64 189.46 805.56 163.34 192.38 1231.17 360.52 193.79 1402.93 1071.48 653.92 1357.02 1073.60 657.54 1370.32 1079.23	6475 6500	233948 808565 524796 479674 808436 516579 479803 822221 517954 480051 57945 1043266 436361 53482 1051785 435845 62168 1043572 436788 572493 246512 236271 737530 251626 235359 1067167 520077 236592 196155 234459 216758 234488 234734 210425 234523	10% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0	16.75 78.45 30.90 29,52 78.34 30.02 29 80.31 30.16 29,54 316.64 224.35 20.89 324.01 225.39 20.86 325.63 226.08 20.96 196.04 3.13 0.11 245.59 14.77 0.03 29.107 34.11 .037 338.31 248.69 335.81 248.69 35.83 329.57 248.69 35.83 329.57 249.57

DE variant	% Optimum solution DE with ELEMAEF / DE without ELEMAEF	Best C. Time
Rand 1 Bin	88% / 22%	DE with ELEMAEF
Rand 1 Exp	22% / 0%	DE without ELEMAEF
Best 1 Bin	77% / 44%	DE without ELEMAEF
Best 1 Exp	22% / 11%	DE without ELEMAEF
Current to Rand 1	0% / 0%	DE without ELEMAEF
Current to best 1	0% / 0%	DE without ELEMAEF
Current to rand 1 Bin	33% / 0%	DE without ELEMAEF
Rand 2 Dir	0% / 0%	DE without ELEMAEF

Table 3: Comparative results between the DE algorithm with ELEMAEF and DE algorithm without it.



Fig. 6: Optimum design of the 3R manipulator with dexterous workspace.

between the exploration and exploitation mechanism in the DE algorithm is an outstanding characteristic to be considered in order to find the optimum solution in this particular design problem.

Design results

The optimal link lengths are provided by using the DE/Rand/1/Bin with ELEMAEF. those are: $l_3^{*ELEMAEF}$ l^{*ELEMAEF} 0.407 = 0.415 $l_{A}^{*ELEMAEF} = 0.0264$. The optimal design meets the objective function and constraints, such that its end-effector can reach the defined workspace with different orientation in the interval $\left[-\frac{pi}{2}, \frac{pi}{2}\right]$. Hence, the manipulator designed by this approach presents a defined dexterous workspace. In Fig. 6 the optimum design $p^{*ELEMAEF}$ of the 3R manipulator with a parallelogram mechanism is displayed. The optimum design guarantees the end-effector can reach the vertices of the workspace

with at least three different orientations. Hence, the optimum design fulfills the objective design, i.e., it has a desired dexterous workspace.

5 Conclusion

In this paper an optimization problem to optimal design the link length of a 3R manipulator with a parallelogram five-bar mechanism is stated. The design involves that the manipulator must fulfil a defined dexterous workspace. An exhaustively local mechanism is incorporated in the differential evolution algorithm to solve the problem. The final optimal design results in a 3R manipulator which its end-effector can be moved in the desired workspace with different orientations, fulfilling the design objective and constraints.

According to the empirical results, the ELEMAEF can search into the design space such that better solutions can be found. The DE with ELEMAEF improves the



convergence to the optimal solution compared with the DE algorithm without ELEMAEF. The DE with ELEMAEF does not require an additional parameter to be tuned. The main drawback of the algorithm is that it requires more functions to be evaluated, such that it requires more computational time.

The strategy of applying a local exploitation mechanism is a very important factor to be included in the metaheuristic algorithm in order to promote the exhaustively search of the optimal solution. Nevertheless, the way that the local exploitation mechanism is working must be carefully analyzed due to the problem of the premature convergence to a local solution.

Acknowledgment

This work was supported in part by Consejo Nacional de Ciencia y Tecnología (CONACyT) under Grant 182298 and in part by the Operation and Development Committee of Academic Activities and the Secretariat of Research and Posgrade of the Instituto Politécnico Nacional under Grant 20131053 and 20131350.

References

- A. G. Erdman, G. N. Sandor, S. Kota, Mechanism Design: Analysis And Synthesis, Prentice Hall, (2001).
- [2] C. M. Gosselin, J. Angeles, Singularity Analysis Of Closed Loop Kinematic Chains, IEEE Transactions On Robotics And Automation, 6, 281-290 (1990).
- [3] K. M. Lee, D. K. Shah, Part 1, Kinematic Analysis Of A 3-Dof In-Parallel Actuated Manipulator. IEEE Journal Of Robotics And Automation, 4, 354-360 (1988).
- [4] Robert L. Norton, Design of Machinery: An Introduction to the Synthesis and Analysis of Mechanisms and Machines, McGraw-Hill, (2003).
- [5] J. E. Shigley, J. J. Uicker, Theory Of Machines And Mechanisms, Mc. Graw Hill, (1995).
- [6] J. P. Merlet, Parallel Robots, Springer, (2006).
- [7] C. M. Gosselin, Determination Of The Workspace Of 6-Dof Parallel Manipulators, Asme Journal Of Mechanical Design, 112, 331-336 (1990).
- [8] A. Gallant, R. Boudreau, M. Gallant, Geometric Determination Of The Dexterous Workspace Of N-Rrrr And N-Rrpr Manipulators, Mechanism And Machine Theory, 51, 159-171 (2012).
- [9] R. E. Stamper, L. W. Tsai, G. C. Walsh, Optimization Of A Three Dof Translational Platform For Well-Conditioned Workspace, IEEE International Conference On Robotics & Automation, 4, 3250-3255 (1997).
- [10] Z. Wang, Z. Wang, W. Liu, Y. Lei, A Study On Workspace, Boundary Workspace Analysis And Workpiece Positioning For Parallel Machine Tools. Mechanism Machine Theory, 36, 605-622 (2001).
- [11] E. J. Haug, C. M. Luh, F. A. Adkins, J. Y. Wang, Numerical Algorithms For Mapping Boundaries Of Manipulator Workspaces. Asme Journal Of Mechanical Design, **118**, 228-234 (1996).

- [12] T. Lung-Wen, Robot analysis: The mechanics of serial and parallel manipulators, John Wiley & Sons, (1999).
- [13] M. W. Spong, M. Vidyasagar, Robot Dynamics and Control, John Wiley & Sons, (2004).
- [14] A. Kumar, K. J. Waldron, The workspaces of a mechanical manipulator, Journal of Mechanical Design, **103**, 665-672 (1981).
- [15] Miguel G. Villarreal-Cervantes, Carlos A. Cruz-Villar, Jaime Alvarez-Gallegos, Edgar A. Portilla-Flores, Robust Structure-Control Design Approach for Mechatronic Systems. IEEE/ASME Transactions on Mechatronics, 18, 1592-1601 (2013).
- [16] S. B. Matekar, G. R. Gogate, Optimum Synthesis Of Path Generating Four-Bar Mechanisms Using Differential Evolution And A Modified Error Function, Mechanism And Machine Theory, **52**, 158-179 (2012).
- [17] R. R. Bulatovic, S. R. Dordevic, Control Of The Optimum Synthesis Process Of A Four-Bar Linkage Whose Point On The Working Member Generates The Given Path, Applied Mathematics And Computation, 23, 9765-9778 (2011).
- [18] E. A. Portilla, et. al., Integration Of Structure And Control Using An Evolutionary Approach: An Application To The Optimal Concurrent Design Of A Cvt, International Journal For Numerical Methods In Engineering, **71**, 883-890 (2007).
- [19] A. Ortiz, J.A. Cabrera, F. Nadal, A. Bonilla, Dimensional synthesis of mechanisms using Differential Evolution with auto-adaptive control parameters, Mechanism and Machine Theory, 64, 210-229 (2013).
- [20] Prasad Vilas Chanekar, Michael Angelo Amith Fenelon, Ashitava Ghosal, Synthesis of Adjustable Spherical Four-Link Mechanisms for Approximate Multi-Path Generation, Mechanism and Machine Theory, **70**, 538-552 (2013).
- [21] Singiresu S. Rao, Engineering Optimization: Theory and Practice, John Wiley & Sons, (2009).
- [22] M. G. Villarreal, C. A. Cruz, J. Alvarez, E. A. Portilla, Kinematic Dexterity Maximization Of An Omnidirectional Wheeled Mobile Robot: A Comparison Of Metaheuristic And Sqp Algorithms, International Journal Of Advanced Robotic Systems, 9, 1-12 (2012).
- [23] Paulo Roberto Bergamaschi, Sezimária de Fátima Pereira Saramago, Leandro dos Santos Coelho, Comparative Study of SQP and Metaheuristics for Robotic Manipulator Design, Applied Numerical Mathematics, 58, 1396-1412 (2008).
- [24] R. Storn, K. Price, A Simple And Efficient Heuristic For Global Optimization Over Continuous Spaces, Journal Of Global Optimization, 11, 341-359 (1997).
- [25] Roger Gämperle, Sibylle D. Müller, Petros Koumoutsakos, A parameter study for differential evolution, Int. Conf. on Advances in Intelligent Systems, Fuzzy Systems, Evolutionary Computation, 293-298 (2002).
- [26] Karin Zielinski, Petra Weitkemper, Rainer Laur, Karl-Dirk Kammeyer, Parameter Study for Differential Evolution Using a Power Allocation Problem Including Interference Cancellation, IEEE Congress on Evolutionary Computation, 1857-1864 (2006).
- [27] Hui-Yuan Fan, Jouni Lampinen, A Trigonometric Mutation Operation to Differential Evolution, Journal of Global Optimization, 27, 105-129 (2003).
- [28] Jingqiao Zhang, Arthur C. Sanderson, JADE: Adaptive Differential Evolution with Optional External Archive, IEEE Transactions on Evolutionary Computation, 13, 945-958 (2009).

[29] Yong Wang, Zixing Cai, Qingfu Zhang, Differential Evolution with Composite Trial Vector Generation Strategies and Control Parameters, IEEE Transactions on Evolutionary Computation 15, 55-66 (2011).

2140

- [30] J. Dongli, Z. Guoxing, K.K. Muhammad, An Effective Memetic Differential Evolution Algorithm Based On Chaotic Local Search, Information Sciences, 181, 3175-3187 (2011).
- [31] W. Chunquiu, et. al., Wind Farm Micro-Siting By Gaussian Particle Swarm Optimization With Local Search Strategy, Renewable Energy, 48, 276-286 (2012).
- [32] M. G. Epitropakis, et. al., Enhancing Differential Evolution Utilizing Proximity-Based Mutation Operators, IEEE Transaction On Evolutionary Computation, 15, 99-119 (2011).
- [33] M. Weber, F. Neri, V. Tirronen, Distributed Differential Evolution With Explorative: Exploitative Population Families, Genetic Programming Evolvable, 10, 343-371 (2009).
- [34] K. V. Price, R. M. Storn, J. A. Lampinen, Differential Evolution: A Practical Approach to Global Optimization. Springer, (2005).
- [35] V. Feoktistov and S. Janaqi, Generalization of the strategies in differential evolution, Proceedings of the 18th International parallel and distributed processing symposium, (2004).
- [36] E. Mezura, J. Velázquez, C. A. Coello, A Comparative Study of Differential Evolution Variants For Global Optimization, Genetic and Evolutionary Computation Conference, 485-492 (2006).
- [37] K. Deb, An Efficient Constraint Handling Method For Genetic Algorithms, Computer Methods In Applied Mechanics and Engineering, 186, 311-338 (2000).
- [38] S. Kukkonen, J. Lampinen, Constrained Real-Parameter Optimization With Generalized Differential Evolution. IEEE Congress On Evolutionary Computation, 911-918 (2006).
- [39] E. Mezura-Montes, J. Velázquez-Reyes, C.A. Coello Coello, Comparing Differential Evolution Models For Global Optimization. Genetica And Evolutionary Computation Conference, 485-492 (2006).
- [40] Zielinski, K., Laur, R., Stopping Criteria For Differential Evolution In Constrained Single-Objective Optimization, Advancesin Differential Evolution. Springer, 111-138 (2008).



Miguel G. Villarreal-Cervantes received the B. S. degree in electronics engineering from the Instituto Tecnológico de Veracruz in 2003 and the M. Sc. and Ph. D. degrees in electrical engineering from the Centro de Investigación y de Estudios Avanzados

(CINVESTAV), Mexico in 2005 and 2010, respectively. He is currently a Researcher of the Mechatronic Section in the Centro de Innovación y Desarrollo Tecnológico en Cómputo del Instituto Politécnico Nacional (CIDETEC-IPN). He is member of the National System of Researcher (S.N.I.) in Mexico. His research interests include robotics and the system optimization, dynamics and control of electro-mechanical systems.



Daniel De la Cruz-Muciño received the B. S. degree in mechanical and electrical engineering from the Instituto Politécnico Nacional (IPN) in 2009. He is currently studied program in а master the mechatronic section in CIDETEC-IPN.



Edgar A. Portilla-Flores Received the B.S. degree in Communications and Electronic engineering from Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana. Mexico in 1992 and the M.S. degree mechanical engineering in from Instituto Tecnológico de Puebla, Mexico in

2002, Ph.D. degree in Electrical engineering from CINVESTAV-IPN in 2006, and a Postdoc at Universidad Estatal de Campinas, Brasil in 2012. He is a researcher in Optimization and Concurrent Design of Mechatronic Systems in CIDETEC-IPN. He is member of the S.N.I. in Mexico.

Natural Sciences Publishing Cor.

© 2014 NSP